

American colonies offers a third route of explanation apart from the typical dichotomy of pragmatism versus principle. She also leaves off the role of the Revolution in facilitating broader toleration in establishment strongholds like Virginia. Parts three and four of the collection are likewise worthwhile, though one wonders why Michael McClymond's chapter on the revivals and revivalism ignores longstanding controversies about the authenticity of the revivals articulated by Frank Lambert and others. Part five offers overviews of subjects that can be read with great interest by specialists and non-specialists. These include chapters on pastoral and academic practice (theology and education) worship (hymnody and sermons), and material culture (meeting houses, chapels, and churches). Some of these chapters suffer from the shortcomings of part one. We are introduced to persons or positions in a context that is less perspicacious than non-specialists would like. Given the nature of the volume as a survey treatment of the period, a more traditional and accessible survey approach would be best. Too many of its chapters are a better fit for more specialized collections.

Glenn Moots

Northwood University

Darkness Falls on the Land of Light: Experiencing Religious Awakenings in Eighteenth-Century New England. By Douglas L. Winiarski. (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2017, Pp. xxii, 607. \$49.95, cloth.)

Douglas Winiarski's *Darkness Falls on the Land of Light* represents a remarkable scholarly achievement. The product of vast research, it offers a most illuminating view of religious life in colonial New England. Winiarski's careful research is visible on each page, both in the text itself and in the innumerable footnotes (yes, there are footnotes, not endnotes). Just as an excellent biography provides the reader with an understanding of both the subject and their context, Winiarski embeds the religious lives of New Englanders firmly in their world and readers are provided with a narrative that weaves the colonists' religious experiences into the fabric of their lives.

One of Winiarski's notable contributions is his treatment of religious life in New England prior to the revival of religion sparked

by the preaching of Whitefield. In part one, Winiarski reveals the depth, variety, and fluctuations that marked the spiritual experiences of New Englanders, and he offers this as a rebuttal to historians who have emphasized the moribundity of religion prior to the Great Awakening. Employing evidence from a wide variety of witnesses, Winiarski describes the ebb and flow of religious zeal, the anxiety that attended participation in the eucharist, and the quickening of piety that accompanied disaster and the deaths of friends and family.

Turning to the “Whitefieldarian” revival, Winiarski provides vivid accounts of the religious experiences of a wide variety of New Englanders. Readers will find new light shed on familiar episodes along with detailed accounts of previously obscure figures. Throughout this section, Winiarski illuminates the manifold transformative consequences of the revival for a wide variety of individuals, communities, and even theological concepts.

Part three, entitled “Exercised Bodies, Impulsive Bibles,” opens with an account of Martha Robinson’s fantastic experiences, including the Devil entering her body. Throughout this expansive section Winiarski recounts the various outcomes and unintended consequences for those gripped by revivalism’s fervor. He depicts clashes between lay people, who applied prophetic or apocalyptic biblical passages, and clergy, who attempted to temper what they perceived as “enthusiasm.” Many clergy, such as Jonathan Edwards, sought to reign in the excited interpretations of the laity by insisting that the miraculous had ceased in the apostolic era. By the mid-1740s, many Congregational clergy were openly opposed to the members of their own congregations, who the ministers perceived to be misreading contemporary events.

The impact of James Davenport’s dramatic and divisive preaching is the center of part four. Winiarski assigns great importance to Davenport and his short but spirited moment in the revival’s spotlight. Davenport and those following in his wake exhibited a new degree of radical theological exclusivity, including offering judgments as to whether a person would be saved or damned. Davenport and his followers’ work is detailed, and Winiarski asserts that their efforts explain the much cooler reception to George Whitefield upon his return to New England for a second preaching tour.

In the fifth and final section, entitled “Travels,” Winiarski describes the “shattered religious culture” (283) that emerged in New England during and persisted after the Whitefieldarian revivals. He describes the foundering of Congregationalism in New England, the various perfectionist and antinomian groups that emerged, other splintering of established groups, and numerous theological disputes. He also chronicles examples of those who left religion entirely. The portrayal of religious life in New England underscores discord and chaos rather than vitality and growth in the aftermath of waves of revival in the region.

Readers of *Darkness Falls on the Land of Light* are treated to a vast amount of primary-source evidence that offers an unparalleled look into the religious experiences of New Englanders in this era. Winiarski does this artfully, providing numerous sketches and vignettes throughout the book. The result is a mountain of evidence, much of it intriguing and even entertaining. The author is subtle as he offers analysis and interpretation, often letting the evidence speak for itself. Perhaps he could have been slightly more explicit in places, explaining how the evidence presented connects to his thesis. This, however, is only a very slight quibble with a magnificent work of history that greatly enriches our understanding of a subject that has already received considerable scholarly attention.

Kyle Welty

The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley

Mystic Moderns: Agency and Enchantment in Evelyn Underhill, May Sinclair, and Mary Webb. By James H. Thrall (Lanham, MD: Lexington Press, 2020, Pp. xix + 293, \$115.00.)

Thrall begins his discussion of authors Evelyn Underhill, May Sinclair, and Mary Webb with a comparison of butter to margarine from Webb’s novel *Gone to Earth* to help ground his discussion of modernity. It is a memorable analogy. One could simply equate butter with tradition and margarine with modernity. Margarine takes the essential purpose of butter and provides it cheaply and rapidly. Ultimately, Thrall notes that “To fully consider the modern, therefore, is to reflect on the always-being-determined value of the ‘new’ as it represents change from the always-being-determined value of the ‘old’” (8). Thrall’s work reminds us that we cannot simply